

Chuang Tzu as Teacher: Pedagogical Insights from the *Chuang Tzu*

Liam Corley

In the third century BCE, a brilliant and idiosyncratic Chinese philosopher wrote an assortment of anecdotes and metaphysical assertions which were later collated by his disciples into a textbook bearing only his name as a title: the *Chuang Tzu*.¹ Chuang Tzu the bizarre; Chuang Tzu the perverse; Chuang Tzu the philosophical imp now elevated into the Taoist empyrean by a host of admirers, disciples, and kindred spirits! Rarely is the passage from great wisdom into religious system so drawn out as in the case of Chuang Tzu. Most often, this transition moves in the opposite direction and is viewed as a decline from revelation to pious reflections, and from thence to secular generalizations. Aquinas attempted something similar to Chuang Tzu's journey when he proposed in his *Summa Theologiae* to arrive at a set religious destination by means of an intellectual journey that began with rational natural laws. In contrast to Aquinas' ratiocinative approach, Chuang Tzu had a more elusive manner of describing the natural way of things. Thomas Merton, a Catholic priest with great admiration for Chuang Tzu, affirms the spiritual tendency of Chuang Tzu's thought: "while there is a certain skeptical and down-to-earth quality in Chuang Tzu's critique of Confucianism, Chuang's philosophy is essentially religious and mystical. It belongs in the context of a society in which every aspect of life was seen in relation to the sacred."² Indeed, Chuang Tzu's presentation of the Tao shares so many characteristics with metaphysical propositions that the tradition of interpreting Chuang Tzu's thought has splintered into philosophical and religious schools. He is thus an excellent model to consider when exploring the connections between spiritual and intellectual pursuits.

For one who has become renowned as an excellent teacher, the character known as Chuang Tzu spends a lot of time heckling or refusing students who come to him for wisdom.³ The pages of Chuang Tzu's text are full of dull disciples, reclusive teachers, *ad hominem* instruction, and inflexible curriculum. At times, education appears as a conflict-filled activity in which hypocritical students and unworthy masters combat each other and adherents of opposing schools. Yet despite the many instances of hostile or inconclusive encounters between teachers and supplicants in Chuang Tzu's

text, learning occurs. Butchers and wheelwrights speak. Princes, masters, and disciples cry out in delight and surprise as they comprehend some new thing. Behind it all, the elusive presence of an author or collection of authors compounds the confusion over the possibility of knowledge transmission by writing and preserving what appears in many ways to be a textbook, an invitation to learners. The *Chuang Tzu* thus contains both philosophical precepts which relate to teaching and scenes of learning in which those precepts are seen in action, albeit in a manner as unorthodox as the philosophy they embody. In an attempt to explain how Chuang Tzu's ideas can inform the pedagogical practice of university instructors, I will first discuss scenes of learning in the *Chuang Tzu* and then shift in discursive mode to a meditative imitation of Chuang Tzu which focuses on contemporary pedagogical implications of his philosophy.

Schooling in ancient China is most often portrayed in the *Chuang Tzu* as occurring through the relationship between master and disciple. Well-known teachers might have several disciples and be occasionally visited by important figures seeking advice. Many teachers in Chuang Tzu's text are presented as having a school of followers. Yet these seemingly successful teachers are invariably exposed as unenlightened creatures, nothing in comparison with the unruly sages who eschew formal schools and the constant prating of disciples. Learning, when it appears, occurs in one-to-one interactions in which a suppliant tracks down a reclusive sage and persists through his rebuffs until he reluctantly gives in to the request for knowledge.⁴ The enlightened sage, according to Chuang Tzu, does not desire the notoriety of being acknowledged as wise. Invitations to teach are like invitations to rule—nothing but trouble. While reluctance or outright hostility may appear unkind to students, the sage knows that insight can only be gained through a student's persistent and inventive responses to obstacles. Learning is like eating. Why provide food unless the ability to chew and swallow is evident? The sage might not browbeat a *group* of students out of a prudent concern for his own wellbeing, but he is always concerned about wasting valuable breath and time in situations which will not result in a benefit to pupil or sage.

This reluctance to teach may appear perverse when a student has presented himself in good faith. Chuang Tzu is aware, however, that a student is likely to be unaware of his militant adherence to preconceived notions. When Chuang Tzu asserts that “[e]ven an idiot has his teacher,” he is referring to the potential of each individual to grow in knowledge if they abandon preconceived notions and use their spontaneous judgments as a guide.⁵ Since most people rely on a fixed system of thinking—their idiosyncratic or received “rights and wrongs,”—in a manner which causes them to “claim

that what doesn't exist exists," they are already ignoring an internal teacher in order to pursue a foolish consistency.⁶ Until the prospective pupil re-engages with her internal teacher and begins to *think* and not merely extend a system, Chuang Tzu chooses to save his breath. Or, more to the point, Chuang Tzu uses his breath to attack whatever fixed point the student has embraced in place of free and easy intellectual wandering. By refusing the student or responding to the request in an unexpected manner, Chuang Tzu tests the supplicant's willingness and ability to see things in a new light. This ability, we shall see, is essential to the student's progress because of another obstacle that confronts students of the Way: the problem of ineffability.

Wheelwright P'ien directly confronts the problem of ineffability when he explains to Duke Huan why the knowledge which can be transmitted through language is only "chaff and dregs."⁷ The wheelwright describes his craft as one which requires a skill that can't be taught or learned by verbal transmission. To be a successful wheelwright, you must "get it in your hand and feel it in your mind."⁸ Language cannot accurately describe the "knack" for making wheels; only personal experience and the individual exercise of judgment—"not too gentle, not too hard"—can develop in a student the skill necessary to make wheels. So it is with most knowledge worth having. The inertia of words can never anticipate the multiplicity of situations in which their meaning may be applied. Agreement with a precept is not understanding; rote application is not skill. For the teacher, these are difficult constraints, and they point towards an important emphasis on heuristics. Students must be able to apply their knowledge in novel ways to address unforeseen circumstances. When Confucius complains in chapter 14 of the *Chuang Tzu* that "not a single ruler has found anything to excite his interest" in his teaching, Lao Tzu declares the reason to be that Confucius is teaching "the old worn-out paths of the former kings."⁹ These paths are merely the traces of an ability to walk across rough terrain. When Lao Tzu explains that a good pair of shoes is more useful to a ruler than a smooth path, he reiterates the lesson of Wheelwright P'ien: the ability to apply knowledge is more valuable than a description of past forms this ability has taken. Confucius' awareness of the difficulty of inculcating this ability in others leads him to take a three-month retreat. At the end of this retreat, he discovers how the Way can be taught without words, and this lesson introduces the next aspect of Chuang Tzu's pedagogical strategy.

"For a long time now I have not been taking my place as a man along with the process of change," Confucius says at the end of his retreat. "And if I do not take my own place as a man along with the process of change, how can I hope to change other men?"¹⁰ Confucius' realization empha-

sizes the role of the teacher as a catalyst of learning in which the teacher's personal orientation towards life is an essential aspect of his teaching. Parents will sometimes say, "Do as I say and not as I do." This insufficient teaching strategy is inverted in Chuang Tzu's pedagogy into the signal characteristic of teaching acumen: do as you would have your students do and say nothing. When Shen Nung complains that his master has abandoned him by dying without teaching him any lessons through words, Yen Kang-Tiao praises the teacher as a true exemplar of the Way: "he knew enough to keep his wild words stored away and to die with them unspoken. . . . The Way that is discoursed upon is not the Way at all!"¹¹ Didactic instruction locks the teacher into a pedagogical strategy of assertion. A practice of assertion, voiced or unvoiced, fossilizes dynamic insights into partial truths. The particulars of Confucius' reorientation after his retreat point towards a pragmatic and yet mystical connection between beings in which an individual who lives in accord with the Way is able to influence others towards living similarly. Voiced or unvoiced, didactic urges can be read by students, and they polarize the learning situation into acceptable or unacceptable practices and outcomes. In short, Chuang Tzu views the desire and attempt to control another's learning as ludicrous, not least for the reason that a didactic posture is antithetical to a learning posture. The story of Confucius' retreat, however, leaves much unsaid as to the insufficiency of his original strategy. We must look elsewhere for a fuller explication of how Chuang Tzu suggests that the sage go about his task of enlightening others.

The story of Yen Hui's intention to visit Wei which opens chapter four of the *Chuang Tzu* gives a more detailed description of the pitfalls and possibilities facing teachers of ineffable ideals, practical ethics, and skillful action.¹² Here Confucius is presented as an interlocutor more in accordance with Chuang Tzu's ideas, and he interrogates Yen Hui on his intended strategies for instructing the king of Wei in virtue. At first, Confucius criticizes Yen Hui's didacticism. Yen Hui is likely to get himself executed if he attempts to teach virtue to a tyrant because by presenting himself as a teacher he makes an implicit challenge to the tyrant's authority. This is due to Yen Hui's intention to instruct the tyrant through the medium of didactic language. By arguing for his interpretation of the ancient classics, Yen Hui will merely antagonize the tyrant. Such instruction makes explicit a comparison between the virtue of the pupil and the virtue of the teacher. Direct comparisons lead to envy, fame, and murder. However, this is just looking at the negative case. Confucius also accounts for the possibility that the king will not be a tyrant. In this case, Yen Hui's instructions will be likewise unnecessary and foolish because the king is already fulfilling his role to perfection. Confucius asserts that the desire to change another person's

behavior through either direct address or implicit judgment is only successful when coupled with the power to force compliance (which is the perquisite of kings). In a different chapter, Lao Tzu counsels Ts'ui Chu to "Be careful—don't meddle with men's minds! Men's minds can be forced down or boosted up, but this downing and upping imprisons and brings death to the mind."¹³ For humble teachers like Yen Hui, didactic intentions will only lead the teacher into confusion and danger. Rather than the king being influenced by the teacher, the teacher will become angry and erratic through the frustrated desire to assert his will and perspective upon an unwilling pupil. Meddling with minds is not the same as communicating worthwhile knowledge and ability to pupils, and the posture of teacher is not the most direct pathway to teaching.

In place of such fruitless and perilous strategies, Confucius enjoins Yen Hui to practice the "fasting of the mind."¹⁴ The fasting of the mind results in an emptiness which is compelling through the fullness of the Way which rushes in to complete it. Emptiness intrudes upon the perceptions of students as both evidence of a teacher's limitations (thus the room for a student's own observations) and as an example of the proper orientation towards the vastness of learning. Fasting the mind involves abandoning intentional outcomes and pointing away from the personality of the teacher or her accomplishments. Shrewd and suspicious, most people can tell when someone wants to affect their opinion on things. If the would-be teacher is liked or feared, perhaps her pupils will use their intuition to conform themselves to the teacher's opinion for a season. However, this conformity will not equip them to *replicate* the teacher's thought process when faced with a new situation requiring a fresh judgment. Indeed, when the teacher is out of sight, her precepts may also be out of mind. The "knack" which Wheelwright P'ien discusses must be learned through other means. When Confucius advises Yen Hui to fast with his mind, he points toward the importance of both self-motivated students and a quality of the teacher which can compel such students to emulate his actions. This quality of the teacher, an essential component of ineffable and skill-based instruction, can be described as charisma.

The fasting of the mind entails more than the abandonment of noxious intentions to be efficacious because it involves a more organic connection between teacher and student than has been heretofore indicated. By fasting with the mind, a teacher engages in a practice which is only imperfectly described as modeling. The student sees an example of disinterested virtue which, depending upon the motivation and insight of the student, will either be compelling or beneath notice. Much like the aggressive insults with which Chuang Tzu often greets supplicants, the fasting of the mind sum-

mons out of the student a response which is also a component part of the knowledge the teacher has to impart. If a student responds to an exemplar of the Way with indifference, no amount of expostulation will convince them of the value of that which they have already rejected. The other element of charisma's functioning is more subtle and difficult to put into words. A teacher draws students into contemplation of the Way not because she is a perfect representation of the Way but rather because her demeanor displays the effulgence of the Way. Confucius describes how "brightness is born" in a "closed chamber."¹⁵ This passage can be glossed by referencing an "imitation" of it by Thomas Merton: "Look at this window: it is nothing but a hole in the wall, but because of it the whole room is full of light. So when the faculties are empty, the heart is full of light. Being full of light it becomes an influence by which others are secretly transformed."¹⁶ A window is an example of useful emptiness. A hole in the wall allows light to fill the room. The window is not the source of light but it cannot be said to be unrelated to the light either. In the same way, a teacher contemplates the particular knowledge of his field and eschews didactic urges in order to become a window for those who are huddled in a dark room. While my description of charisma does not fully capture the organic connection between beings which Chuang Tzu seems to suggest, it should be more clear how it is an appropriate vehicle for the transmission of ineffable ideas. Charisma is the means of "secretly transform[ing]" students.

An example of a charismatic teacher appears in chapter 21 of the *Chuang Tzu*, "T'ien Tzu-Fang." Marquis Wen questions T'ien Tzu-Fang as to the identity of his teacher, and T'ien reveals that he never praises his teacher. Given the deprecation of fame and cravings for praise which are repeated throughout the *Chuang Tzu*, T'ien's failure to praise his master shouldn't be seen as a criticism or lack of respect. Instead, T'ien describes his master as "the kind of man who is True—the face of a human being, the emptiness of heaven. . . . If men do not have the Way, he has only to put on a straight face and they are enlightened; he causes men's intentions to melt away."¹⁷ Indeed, even T'ien's recitation of his master's virtue has the same effect as viewing his face: upon hearing T'ien's description, Marquis Wen declares that "my body has fallen apart and I feel no inclination to move; my mouth is manacled and I feel no inclination to speak. . . . This state of Wei is in truth only a burden to me!"¹⁸ T'ien's master affects the intentions of others simply by putting on a "straight face" because his face displays the emptiness of Heaven. He thus serves as a conduit for others to see in him a reflection, or to use the wording of Jonathan Edwards, a re-emanation of the Way's brilliance.¹⁹ The particular affect of annihilating

the intentions of others is also not an indication of general lassitude but is rather a sign of these men's conversion to the Taoist life of free and easy wandering. Marquis Wen professes to find his role as ruler to be burdensome in much the same way that the sage Hsü Yu declares that he has "no use for the rulership of the world."²⁰ T'ien's forgetfulness of his teacher is evidence that his teacher has successfully passed on to him the emptiness of the Way. To quote a later section of T'ien Tzu-Fang's chapter, "I serve you best when I have utterly forgotten you, and you likewise serve me best when you have utterly forgotten me."²¹ Forgetfulness is related to charisma because what the student is drawn to in the teacher is not the teacher himself, otherwise the result of the teacher's charisma would be temporally limited fame. Rather, the teacher has charisma and the student is drawn to it because the charisma points to something beyond the teacher, and that something (a limitless field of knowledge) can occupy the student long after the teacher's death.

All of the above scenes of learning, however, exist merely as narrations or, at best, transcriptions of interactions between long-dead teachers and students. In order to bring this discussion of Chuang Tzu's pedagogy to the present, I now turn to how the *Chuang Tzu* serves as a textbook which purports to do that which I have been arguing can only occur through the collusion of motivated students and charismatic teachers. The constant shifts in perspective and topic which occur throughout the book frustrate a reader's desire for conceptual clarity and discursive closure. By alternating between narrative and philosophical discourse, Chuang Tzu blurs the genre lines which are traditionally used to reinforce distinctions between propositional truth claims and metaphoric or allegoric truth claims. These writing strategies replicate the elusiveness of the Taoist sage and the raucous playfulness which characterizes him when he is drawn into speech. While this may appear contradictory, I believe that the text demonstrates the power of charisma to influence readers from within their own consciousness as they attempt to bring clarity and unity to the chaotic assemblage of stories and precepts found in the *Chuang Tzu*. To the degree that readers invest the *Chuang Tzu* with consistent meaning and continuous intentions, they engage in play with an elusive narrator. By constructing a framer of the text named Chuang Tzu, a reader gives a name to that which might better be described as an absence, or emptiness. The textbook is merely a window, a series of glimpses into a mode of thinking shaped by the metaphysical presuppositions of Taoism. When the textbook's meaning is comprehended, it can be discarded in the same way, to borrow an image from Chuang Tzu, that a fish trap is laid aside once a fish has been caught in it.²² As a preliminary gesture towards such an act of discarding, I offer

the following reflections on how Chuang Tzu's way of being a teacher might be applied to an American university context.

Application: The Way of Teaching

The American university system shares relatively few traits with the institutions of learning in ancient China that fostered Chuang Tzu and his school of followers. In most university classrooms, the factual exchange of information works to prepare one segment of society for the technological management and control of the remainder. This quantifiable system of education appears to reward teachers who are skilled only in the transmission of data. In this system, Chuang Tzu's emphasis on the sincerity of the student and the charisma of the teacher appears, at first glance, archaic. Furthermore, Chuang Tzu's emphasis on the ability to use knowledge skillfully and the inability of discursive instruction to convey this skill seems to suggest an impossible dilemma of outcome evaluation. The university system, for the most part, has inverted the power relation between teacher and student such that the relationship between ruler and subject seems a more relevant description of the educational exchange than perilous or apathetic dilemmas faced by Yen Hui and Confucius. In business-oriented schools where student feedback is directly linked to hiring and firing of faculty, poor teaching may still result in repercussions for the instructor. However, in a system where the freedom and power of the teacher is institutionally assured, all sorts of poor teaching can flourish, that is, teaching which fails to acknowledge the limitations of classroom instruction and the essential, incoercible role of students in successful learning.

Although the modern research university's self-understanding is based on impersonal *Wissenschaft* (knowledge creation), an older notion of *Bildung* (formation) remains important in education which aims at the recruitment of future teachers, scientists, and innovative business leaders.²³ Through a focus on *Bildung*, the university professor who wishes to teach according to the way of Chuang Tzu can do so while still fulfilling the institutional demands of a quantifiable curriculum. Though it is helpful, Chuang Tzu's pedagogy does not require students who are consciously motivated. Indeed, the most spectacular instances of the beneficent effect of a ruler or teacher who has aligned her practice with the Way occur where the student or subject is unaware of how the Way is operating to affect him or her. In the case of an American university setting where many students carry a residue of disdain for learning garnered through their compulsory K-12 education, a pedagogical focus on eliciting an unconscious motivation is more likely to bear fruit than a passive presentation designed to satisfy only those

with a conscious appetite for knowledge. A teacher enamored of his or her “way” of knowledge is likely to have an impact on students who don’t know what they are hungering after until they’ve seen the effects of such an appetite in the life of another.

Convincing skeptical readers of the relevance of Chuang Tzu’s pedagogy to basic and advanced instruction in the humanities and sciences would require discipline-specific transcriptions of classroom interactions not unlike Plato’s dialogues. The four pedagogical insights which I have derived from the *Chuang Tzu*—an emphasis on student initiative for learning to begin; an apprenticeship in which the skillful use of knowledge is entwined with ineffability; educational transformation through charisma; and leaving sufficient chaos to require students to construct their own sense of the coherence of discipline-specific knowledge—address the context of learning, the role of the instructor, and the educational impacts of a Taoist perspective on practical knowledge. In an attempt to achieve a more comprehensive presentation of the relevance of Chuang Tzu’s pedagogy to the diverse educational needs and settings of the modern university, I present the following brief couplets of meditative narrative and poetry as a discursive space that may enable readers to make connections between their own knowledge base and Chuang Tzu’s. Through this change in register, I hope to elicit the same degree of reader engagement that Chuang Tzu encourages in the framing of his textbook. Consequently, the following five moments are only preliminary suggestions of where I believe Chuang Tzu’s pedagogical strategy can be expressed within an American university context.

The First Moment: When stepping into the classroom, our first question should not be, “What will I teach today?” but rather, “Who is here to learn?” Find but one, and we accomplish more than a dozen lessons. A lesson plan is only the framework for teaching; learning requires as much effort from my students as it does from me. In order to learn, hesitant swimmers must be guided by patient hands from the pool’s edge into its deeper parts. An occasional swimming demonstration can be useful, but in the end it won’t save students from drowning.

Patience, that limitless virtue,
spends freely the cash
of other people’s efforts.
When pushing a boulder
up a hill, be patient.

Even Sisyphus knew
that rushing
wouldn't get
the gods' attention.

The Second Moment: In order to fly, baby eaglets first learn to fall. Driven from the nest by a watchful mother, the eaglet begins its fall to death, weakly flapping its wings. Caught before impact by the swooping mother eagle, the eaglet is returned to the nest, winded and wondering at the sensation of flight.²⁴ Tomorrow, the exercise begins again. The wise teacher allows her students to experience the moments of terror, silence, and frantic effort that can prepare them to fly. When I do all the intellectual exercise in class, I allow students to remain weak. Thrusting myself into every learning situation, I give answers instead of strategies for learning; I am the one who is afraid of falling. Words alone will not catch me.

Satisfying an urge for truth
is like taking a long journey. In a country
with only one good road, or two,
the sandal-maker and merchant of cloth are more prized
than the mapmaker, for when the traveler
reaches her destination,
she will still find use for their wares.

The good teacher equips students
for many journeys, not merely the one
he has already made.

The Third Moment: The worst teachers are convinced they have poor students. The best find brilliance in simple minds. There was once a teacher so kind and humble and wise that no student ever feared to answer her questions. She grew powerful through her students' love. Silence was her secret ally. Still air, like still water, provides the means for reflection. Meanwhile, my roving eyes emphasize that I, at least, am comfortable in this void of knowledge. At times, it helps if I repeat the question.

Henri Nouwen—mystic, priest,
and master-teacher—said,
“A word spoken
from silence
is a word
of power.”

I say such power
must be shared.

The Fourth Moment: Weak visions of student accomplishment often result from limited attainments in the teacher's own mind. To learn means that we are ushered outside of ourselves. The stretching gained by developing expertise gave me an awareness of vast spaces for attainment. By finding myself in the midst of vastness, I recognize my emptiness. By remaining empty, a teacher creates a vacuum which draws students into the pursuit of knowledge. When I am full of myself or my learning, I act as an expert: patient, indulgent, and utterly repelling.

To possess great treasure makes
one feel rich. Riches
which cannot be lost,
stolen, or denied
may even make generous men of misers.
How much more the master
at his trade! He is like
the connoisseur of sunlight
who awakens before the dawn
and counts his treasure
throughout the day.
Would he blot out the sky
for an instant?

The Fifth Moment: Fear of spontaneity is a hindrance in the teacher to the variety of learning paths that students may take towards the shared goal of comprehending the material in a course. A fact can be approached through more than one question; a question can lead to more than one fact. When students become involved in the pursuit of knowledge, they sprint in several directions at once. Like yearlings being trained for speed, their impulses toward spontaneous thought should be guided, not blocked by barriers or stopped by pulling on the small bit of an originally conceived intention. We are dead to knowledge and no longer able to teach when we are afraid or unable to harness the questions and impulses of our students.

A good swimmer forgets the water,
Therefore she pilots a boat
Without fear. A good teacher
Forgets the text and gives up knowledge.

Therefore, his students continually
Leap into the sea, turning somersaults
In the air. He too has been forgotten.

Notes

1. Chuang Tzu has become known in the West through a variety of transliterated names, among them Zhuang Zi and Chuang Tze, Taoism is also commonly referred to as Daoism according to the standardized Pinyin transliteration of Chinese names or words. Since most of the printed materials quoted in this work use the Wade-Giles system of transliterating Chinese words, I use the Wade-Giles system as well in order to avoid confusion.
2. T. Merton, trans., "Introduction," in *The Way of Chuang Tzu* (New York: New Directions, 1965), 16.
3. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968).
4. To be sure, interaction is not the only means of learning in the *Chuang Tzu*. Cook Ting describes his learning process as occurring principally through repetition. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968), 50-51.
5. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968), 39.
6. Ibid
7. For an example of how the knowledge transmitted through language is specious, see the sarcastic genealogy which the Woman Crookback gives to Nan-po Tzu-k'uei in order to explain how she learned the Way. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968), 82-83.
8. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968), 153
9. Ibid, 166
10. Ibid
11. Ibid, 242
12. Ibid, 54-58
13. Ibid, 116
14. Ibid, 57
15. Ibid, 58
16. T. Merton, trans., "Introduction," in *The Way of Chuang Tzu* (New York: New Directions, 1965), 53.
17. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York:

Columbia UP, 1968), 221.

18. Ibid, 222

19. J. Edwards, *Basic Writings*, ed. Ola Elizabeth Winslow (New York: Penguin, 1966). Edwards' struggle to understand how the regenerate believer can participate in God's work in the world is an excellent example of a teacher grappling with a similar problem of transmission. See "Concerning the End for which God Created the World" for Edwards' explication of the concept of re-emanation.

20. B. Watson, trans., *The Complete Works of Chuang Tzu* (New York: Columbia UP, 1968), 33

21. Ibid, 224

22. Ibid, 302

23. See Mark Schwehn's challenging study of the academic vocation for more on the impact of Max Weber's educational ideals on the structure of American universities, *Exiles from Eden: Religion and the Academic Vocation in America* (New York: Oxford UP, 1992).

24. This image is taken from Deuteronomy 32:11-12. I am grateful to Stephen A. Hayner for suggesting it.